Building the Bridge Between Recruitment and Selection

TMHRA Nuts and Bolts of HR in the Public Sector
About CPS HR Consulting

CPS HR is a self-supporting public agency providing a full range of integrated HR solutions to government and nonprofit clients across the country. We have a deep expertise and unmatched perspective in guiding our clients in the areas of organizational strategy, recruitment and selection, classification and compensation, and training and development.

Our mission is to transform human resource management in the public sector.
Our Services

Organizational Strategy
- Workforce & Succession Planning
- Organizational Assessment, Design, Development
- HR Outsourcing
- Change Management
- Employee Engagement
- Performance Management
- Investigations

Classification & Compensation
- Classification
- Compensation

Training & Development
- Training
- Coaching
- Leadership Development

Organizational Performance

Influencing Factors
- Technology
- External Factors
- Mission, Vision, Values
- Stakeholders

Goals, Objectives
- Strategic Plan
- Organizational Culture
- Regulatory Requirements
Overview/Agenda

Recruitment
- Understanding the Job
- Recruitment Factors and Practices
- Advertising and Social Media

Selection
- Interviewing Strategies and Best Practices
- Considerations in Use of Technology
Building the Bridge

**Recruiting:**
The process of generating a pool of qualified applicants

**Selection:**
The process of choosing individuals with the necessary qualifications
Getting It Right the First Time

• Hire the right people . . .
  Leadership is fun
• Hire the wrong people . . .
  Leadership is tough
• Employee selection is one of management's most important responsibilities
• If you get it right the first time, you will have less turnover and less need to recruit in the future
True or False

• It is estimated that replacing a full-time employee costs at least 25% of that employee’s total annual compensation
Cost of Turnover

• Costs of recruitment and selection:
  – Replacing supervisory, technical and management personnel can cost from 25% percent of salary to several hundred percent of salary.
Cost of Turnover

- Advertising
- Interview time
- Reference checking
- Unproductive work time (lost opportunities)
- Quality
- Hidden administrative costs
- Job morale of others
- Increased Customer Dissatisfaction
Common Selection Errors

- Lack of clearly-defined job requirements and qualifications
- Untrained supervisors/poorly conducted interviews
- Decisions made purely on a "gut feeling“ (me-too syndrome)
- Decisions made on the verbal "selling skills" of the candidate
- Hiring a warm body/accepting less than the best
- Lack of quality time with candidates
- Not conducting reference checks
Candidate Funnel

Recruitment

Applicants in

Candidates out

Selection

Candidates in

New hires out
Building the Bridge

**Recruiting:**
The process of generating a pool of qualified applicants

**Selection:**
The process of choosing individuals with the necessary qualifications
Hiring the Right Person: Recruitment

- RECRUITMENT
  - The process of attracting individuals in sufficient numbers with the right skills and at appropriate times to apply for open positions within the organization.
Alternative Staffing

- Restructuring/consolidation of jobs
- Part-time
- Outsourcing: vendors, partnerships
- Training for promotions
- Volunteer to Paid Staff
- Interns
- Job sharing, flex-time
Recruitment Plan

- Define the position
- Determine selection criteria
- Decide if there are alternatives to recruitment
- Decide where to advertise/source candidates
- Assess success of recruitment sources in the past (yield ratios)
- Develop specific ads
First, Define and Understand the Job

• Review your Job Descriptions
  – Are JD’s reflective of job being performed?
• What is the job doing now and in the near future?
• What are the minimum qualifications?
  – Education
  – Experience
  – Licenses/Certifications
Superman/Superwoman Doesn’t Exist

- Knowledge, Skills, and Abilities:
  - Able to run faster than a speeding bullet
  - Skill to outperform the power of a locomotive
  - Able to leap tall buildings in a single bound

- Compensation:
  - Commensurate with experience as a mild-mannered reporter
Selection Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Must</th>
<th>Intangible</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tangible</td>
<td>Intangible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College Degree</td>
<td>Creativity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certification</td>
<td>Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Flexibility</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What can be trained?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tangible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job-related skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Recruitment and Selection....
It all starts with Job Analysis (or it should!)

• A purposeful, systematic process for collecting information on the important, work-related aspects of a job

• Results in an identification of the important behaviors performed on the job (duties/tasks) and the qualifications necessary to perform those behaviors successfully (knowledge, skills, abilities, other characteristics)
Foundation of all HR practices

Legal Compliance

Employee Relations

Rewards

Safety & Health

HR Planning

Training

Performance Management

Staffing
Foundational

• HR planning:
  – Work design.
  – Skills required.

• Staffing:
  – Advertising in labor market.
  – Selection criteria.
  – Selection methods.
  – Succession planning.

• Training:
  – Training needs for new employees.
  – Training program content.
  – Training evaluation.

• Performance management:
  – Performance standards.
  – Evaluation criteria.
  – Appraisal forms and methods.
  – Feedback and communication with employees.
Question

• What sources do you use to find quality candidates?
Goals of Recruitment

Why recruit?

- Identify interested candidates
- Elicit interest in qualified candidates
- Ensure an adequate pool of interested, qualified candidates to meet selection need
- Promote EEO/diversity in the workforce
- Market the employer for current and future needs
- Anything else??
Sourcing Candidates

- Assess what worked in the past
- Make sure you are competitive
- Go for quality not quantity of candidates
- Consider employee referral program
  - This is better if your employees like you
- Network with colleagues
- Respond to applicants quickly (the good ones get scooped up)
- Brand agency
Recruitment Factors

- **Why** is the selection process being requested/administered now?
- **Who** are the target applicants?
- **Where** are the target applicants?
- **What** is the best way/manner/means to “reach” target applicants?
- **When** is the best time to “reach” target applicants?
- **When** is the eligible list or outcome needed?
Recruitment Effects on the Selection Process

• *Quality* of the candidate pool

• *Size* of the candidate pool

*The Best Selection Process is only as effective as the qualifications of candidates*
Market Factors

- **Aging labor force/labor market**
- **Generational differences of applicants/employees**
- **Mobile, “nomadic” workforce**
- **Unemployment rates**
- **Strong or Weak economy**
- Belief that **opportunities** exist and current job is **stable/safe**
Workforce/Organizational Factors

- *Traditional* workplace/employer
- * Longer-tenured * employees v. newer employees
- Hiring *process* *user-friendliness*
- Employer *loyalty* beliefs, judgments, and perceptions
- Employer *reputation*...
Employer Reputation

- Salaries/compensation
- Benefits
- Working conditions
  - Flexibility (schedule, assignments)
  - Telecommuting options
  - Job growth/opportunity
  - Training and development opportunities
  - Rewards/reinforcement
  - Retention/promotional opportunities
  - Organizational culture
  - Stability
  - Professional reputation of the organization/work group
Internal Environment

• Promotion from within:
  – Advantages:
    • Promotion as a reward for good work.
    • Motivational tool for other employees.
    • Promoted employee gets up to speed must faster in his or her new job (not always true)
  – Disadvantages:
    • Must fill the position vacated by the promoted employee.
    • Lack of new ideas and creativity that may come from a new person.
    • Jealousy from those not promoted.
Internal Recruitment

• Job Posting: The process of announcing job openings to employees.
  – Job information must be made available to all employees.
  – Ensure minority workers and disadvantaged individuals are aware of job opportunities.
  – Employee cynicism occurs when there is not “equal” opportunity for open positions.

• Employee Referrals:
  – Some believe this is the route to the best employees.
  – Can perpetuate discriminatory hiring practices.
HR Dilemma: Employee Referrals

An organization starts an employee referral program to find employees for its assembly plant. The program is very effective, but no candidates from protected groups are referred or hired.

1. Could the organization be guilty of discrimination?
2. Should the organization abandon its referral program?
External Environment

- Labor market conditions:
  - Strong economy = difficulty hiring.
  - Weak economy = too many applicants.
External Recruitment

- Employment agencies.
- Executive search firms.
- In-house recruiters.
- Local advertising:
  - Newspaper.
  - Multimedia.
- Internships.
- Job fairs.
- College recruiting.
- Walk-in candidates.
Internet Recruiting

• Advantages:
  – Quick and easy to post announcement.
  – Responses arrive faster and in greater quantity.
  – Will generate a wider range of applicants.
  – Applicants can be screened by computer.
  – Some selection tests can be administered by computer.
  – Automated applicant tracking.

• Disadvantages:
  – Ease of submission will result in a lot of applicants, many whom are not qualified.
  – May take more HR time to sort through the greater quantity of applicants.
Recruitment for Diversity

• An ethnically diverse workforce enhances creativity and may facilitate expansion into global markets.

• Recruiting must generate applicants from a wide variety of individuals.

• Train recruiters to use objective standards.

• Include pictures of minority and disabled employees on recruitment flyers.
Discrimination Issues in Hiring

- Civil Rights Act of 1964.
- Pregnancy Discrimination Act of 1975
- *Equality Act Pending (H.R. 3185)*
- Local regulations can add further protections against discrimination.
Discrimination Issues in Hiring

- 9,698 EEOC charges related to hiring

Does anyone know what bases had the most charges for hiring issues?
Race, ADA, or ADEA
How Are You Promoting Your Organization?
Where would you prefer to work?

The Director of Finance reports to the City Manager. The Finance Department has an Annual Budget of $1.6 million and ten full-time staff members (9.5 FTEs). The Director is responsible for accounting, operating and capital budget preparation, financial management systems, purchasing, banking relationships, investment management, debt management, preparation of financial reports, utility rate-making processes, and treasury services. In addition, this role works closely with the Economic & Housing Development Department to evaluate the financial impacts of economic development initiatives.
Where would you prefer to work?

The City and County of Denver is taking IT to the next level. Come lead the effort! Spurred by Mayor Hancock's vision for Peak Performance, the Technology Services agency has an opportunity to lead innovative changes in how government services are delivered to real people with modern technologies, including Social, Mobile, and Cloud. Help drive the Mayor's priorities around Jobs, Safety and Kids...make a real difference in a community that is poised like none other to drive innovation and improve the lives of our constituents. Are you someone with the courage and skills to make a difference? Has the need to contribute rather than be part of the rhetoric been nagging at you? This is your moment!

The individual selected for this position will be an integral member of the Mayor's team. Can you imagine being part of a team running a major metropolitan city? Can you imagine actually doing something about the issues facing your community? Can you imagine using the most modern technology available today to do so?

We need you. Public service is an honorable way to spend four years. Imagine if every successful leader spent even two years serving his or her community in a hand's on dedicated way. It could change the world. You could change the world.
More than Posting a Bulletin

- Active
- Passive
- Internal
Innovation or Hype?
The BIG THREE
Private Sector

“Across industries, there is near-universal adoption of social recruiting.”

94%  78%  73%
49% • Better Candidates

43% • More Candidates

33% • Time to Hire (WHY?)
< 50% Public Sector
Public Sector Uses

- Announcing openings: 46.20%
- Participating in groups: 18.10%
- Searching candidates to invite: 12.30%
- Verifying qualifications: 8.10%
- Investigating: 3.50%
Why Is This Important?

• Agencies compete with commercial industry for talent
• Pool of available talent is rapidly shrinking
• With the contrast between government and commercial salaries, agencies must find ways to leverage technology and trends for more level competition.
• Public Sector takes longer, on average, to hire
Effective Social Media Practices

- Have a policy and consistent approach
- Extend and enhance other activities
- No rogue managers/googlers; training
- Maintain documentation
- Create user experience that highlights organization as great place to work
Building the Bridge

Recruiting: The process of generating a pool of qualified applicants

Selection: The process of choosing individuals with the necessary qualifications
Remember the funnel…

Recruitment

Applicants in

Candidates out

Selection

Candidates in

New hires out
Selection Tests

• SELECTION TEST: Any instrument that is used to make a decision about a potential employee.

• STANDARDIZATION: Uniformity of procedures and conditions related to administering tests.

• RELIABILITY: The extent to which a selection test provides consistent results.

• VALIDITY: The extent to which a test measures what it claims to measure. Do higher test scores relate to higher success on the job?
Types of Selection Methods/Tests

• Interviews
• Job Knowledge Tests (filing, Outlook, customer service)
• Cognitive Aptitude (reasoning, vocabulary)
• Personality Tests (DiSC, Myers-Briggs)
• Integrity Tests
• Physical Fitness Tests
• Assessment Centers (In-Basket, Written, Presentations)
Applicant Perceptions

• Research
  – Applicants want selection tools that they perceive are related to the job

• Practical Implications
  – Use face valid tests or provide information about the test’s job relevancy
Applicant Perceptions

• Research
  – More favorable attitudes toward selection process with explanation of link to future performance

• Practical Implications
  – Provide an overview of what the selection process is measuring
Applicant Perceptions

• Research
  – Procedures that are seen as consistently administered are viewed as more fair

• Practical Implications
  – Standardize administration and explain any deviation to applicants
Interviews
Interviewing Candidates

• Team or individual interviewer?

• Structured or patterned interview:
  – Pre-set questions asked of all candidates.

• Nondirective interview:
  – Minimum # of questions, not planned in advance.
  – Open-ended questions; interviewer follows the candidate’s lead.

• Situational and problem-solving interview:
  – Candidate describes how he or she would solve a problem.

• Behavioral interview/Experiential:
  – Candidate describes how he or she responded to a specific situation.
Why Interviews Fail

- Fail to understand the nature of the job
- Fail to get enough information
- Does not match job with candidate
- Fail to evaluate resume
- Settle for superficial, rehearsed answers
- Is only concerned with skills or personality – not both
Screening Interview

• Usually conducted by telephone.
• Not done in all organizations.
• A few straight-forward questions.
• Can eliminate those less qualified early in the selection process.
During the Interview

• Build rapport quickly
• Provide overview of interview process (agenda)
• Let the candidate do the talking
• Probe carefully for potential problems, but stay legal and do not offend (gaps, demotions)
• Keep on track but do not be rigid
During the Interview

- Keeping it job-related (job analysis results)
- Ask for clarification, use silence, ask for examples
- Look for cues (what isn’t said)
- Ask open-ended questions
- Establish line of continuous communication
- Beware of biases
- Listen and be engaged
Bias in Interviewing

- **Halo Effect** – assessing highly because of one strength
- **Horn/Harshness Effect** – assessing poorly because of one weakness
- **Cultural Noise** – Telling interviewer what they want to hear
- **Contrast** – Comparing candidates to each other
- **First Impression** - snap judgments that allows first impressions (either positive or negative) to cloud the entire interview
- **Stereotyping/Prejudice** – allowing own beliefs to influence judgements
Bias in Interviewing

- Leniency
- Gut Feeling
- Negative Emphasis
- Non-Verbal Bias
- Question Inconsistency
- Recency Effect
- Similar to me
Applicant Perceptions

- **Research**
  - Applicants prefer processes that allow for two-way communication

- **Practical Implications**
  - Provide opportunities for interaction and make applicants aware of these opportunities
Legal Issues

• Age
• Race, Color, National Origin
• Marital status
• Gender (including pregnancy, childbirth, number of children)
• Religion
• Status regarding public assistance
• Disability (physical or mental)
• Military
• Workers' compensation claims
• Union membership
• Appearance
• Arrest records
What to ask and not ask

• Age
  – Instead of:
    • When did you graduate?
    • When do you intend to retire?

  – Ask:
    • Are you old enough to do this type of work?
    • Can you supply transcripts of your education?
What to ask and not ask

• Race
  – A candidate’s race will usually be at least somewhat evident, but race related discussions or questions may imply a preoccupation with that factor.
What to ask and not ask

• National Origin/Citizenship
  – Instead of:
    • Are you a citizen of the US?
    • What country are you from?
    • Where is your accent from?
    • What nationality is your last name?
    • When does your visa expire?

  – Ask:
    • If you are hired, are you able to provide documentation to prove that you are eligible to work in the US?
What to ask and not ask

• **Sex/marital status**
  – Instead of:
    • Are you married?
    • When do you plan to start a family?
    • Do you have children?
  – Ask:
    • Are you available to travel frequently?
    • Can you work overtime with no notice?
    • Can you work evenings and weekends?
    • When we check references/do a background check, are there other names we should look under?
What to ask and not ask

• Religion
  – Instead of:
    • What outside activities do you participate in?
  – Ask:
    • What professional associations are you a member of?
What to ask and not ask

• Disability
  – Instead of:
    • Do you have a disability?
    • Have you ever filed a workers compensation claim?
    • Do you have a history of drug or alcohol abuse?
What to ask and not ask

• Disability
  – Ask
    • After reviewing the job description, “Can you do the duties listed in the job description, with or without accommodation?”
    • If a worker has an obvious disability or reveals a hidden disability, you may ask the person to describe or demonstrate how the applicant would perform job duties.
  – Must do
    • Employers must provide reasonable accommodation to candidates who have disabilities.
What to ask and not ask

- **Military**
  - Instead of:
    - Please provide the status of your military discharge.
    - Will you miss work to perform military service?
  
  - Ask:
    - What experience did you gain in the uniformed service that is relevant to the job you would be doing?
What to ask and not ask

• Appearance
  – Guidelines:
    • Employers need to be aware of religious and cultural variations on appearances.
    • Example: Religion Vs. Fashion (Abercrombie and Fitch)
What to ask and not ask

Arrests and convictions

> Instead of:

  • Have you ever been arrested?

> Ask:

  • Have you ever been convicted of a felony? (You must qualify this question by stating that a conviction will not automatically disqualify a candidate).
Behavioral Interviewing

“More than a gut feeling”

A behavioral example is a specific life history event which will tell you about the individual's skills. When you gain behavioral examples, you typically will hear references to names, dates, numbers, times, and locations and will have "real" information about a person's background.
Sample Behavioral Questions

• Tell me about a time when you worked with a colleague on a special project. What was your role? How did you go about organizing the project? What were the outcomes?

• Outline a specific time when you encountered an unexpected problem and had to solve it. What did you do? What was the outcome?
Situational Questions
Or...
Experiential Questions

• A situational interview is a structured interview that contains questions about how an applicant might handle a specific job situation.
  – What would you do if ...
  – How would you handle ....
Sample Situational Questions

• What would you do if the priorities on a project you were working on changed suddenly?

• Describe how you would handle a situation in which you faced resistance when introducing a new idea or policy to a team or work group.
Realistic Job Preview

• Provide a realistic preview of the job
  – The good, the bad and the ugly
• Provide outline of standards and expectations
  – And the values of the organization
• Outline the culture of the organization and what gets rewarded
  – What makes a good fit and a successful employee
Post Checks

- Reference checks and are CRITICAL
- If you have a third party assist, be in compliance with FCRA (Home Depot)
- If there are discrepancies, contact the candidate
- Try to touch base with the direct supervisor
- Document checks, especially when you are unable to secure a reference
Typical reference check questions:

• Title/Salary/Primary Duties:
• Strengths of candidate (technical and soft skills)
• Red flags or areas we need to be concerned about
• Why left/would you hire back? What would make him leave a job?
• What would the ideal job be for this candidate? What kind of boss will the candidate most likely succeed under?
• Issues (from interview) - job hop, level of responsibility, attitude, relationship building, team, etc. based on requirements of position
• What one suggestion would you give the candidate in terms of helping him/her to be successful?
• What else do we need to know about the candidate?
Legal Liability

- **DEFAMATION**: The act of harming the reputation of another by making a false statement to a third party.

- **NEGLIGENCE**: The failure to exercise the standard of care that a reasonably prudent person would have exercised in the same situation.
Legal Liability - Negligence

- NEGLIGENT REFERRAL: The legal risk incurred when a past employer fails to warn a potential employer of the inherent danger presented by a former employee.

- NEGLIGENT HIRING: The liability incurred when failing to conduct a reasonable investigation of an applicant’s background and then assigns a potentially dangerous person to a position where he or she can inflict harm.
Don’t Forget BG Checks

“And if my potential future employer is watching this, bow down to…….
True or False

• As much as 40 percent of applicants lie about their work histories and educational backgrounds and about 20 percent present false credentials and licenses.
Screening Using Social Media

Should I take that photo off Facebook before my interview?
Screening Using Social Media:

• 2012 careerbuilder.com survey
  – 37% of employers use social media to screen job candidates
  – 34% of those employers find content causing rejection
    • Inappropriate photos
    • Drinking/Drug Use
    • Poor communication skills
    • Discriminatory statements
    • Lying about qualifications

• Cyberpsychology Journal Study:
  – If social media site shows candidate drinking beer, much less likely to get the job, or are offered a lower salary, compared with family/professional pictures
  – Easy to get to unlawful factors influencing decisions
Safer Screening

• Designate searchers who’s not decision-maker
• Train where to look and what is prohibited
• Avoid claims of privacy violation
  – Disclose possibility of online search
  – Don’t use subterfuge: “surreptitious friending”
• Late in hiring process to minimize discrimination claims
Make Offer

• Review candidates against criteria, not against each other
• Make offer and put in writing
• Inform other candidates the position is closed
• Inform staff that position has been filled
Applicant Perceptions

• Research
  – Form letters of rejection are perceived more negatively than those with a clear explanation

• Practical Implications
  – Deliver informative feedback on application reviews, test scores, and hiring decisions
Applicant Perceptions

• Research
  – Failure to receive timely feedback is a primary contributor to perceptions of unfairness

• Practical Implications
  – Provide feedback regarding selection and hiring decisions in a timely manner
Visit us at

www.cpshr.us

More Questions?

Contact us

Joshua Smith – jsmith@cpshr.us